

# Section 1. Performance of International Flights

## Notification of Compliance with or Differences from Language Provisions in Annexes 1, 6, 10 and 11

To: The Secretary General  
International Civil Aviation Organization  
999 University Street  
Montreal, Quebec  
Canada H3C 5H7

2. The following differences will exist on 5<sup>th</sup> March 2010 between regulations and/or practices of Russian Federation and the language provisions as detailed in table 1, paragraph 3 of Attachment B of this State letter.

Annex Provision	Difference Category	Details of Difference	Remarks
Annex 1. 1.2.9.4, Appendix 1, Attachment A	<b>C</b>	The date of commencement of ICAO language requirements implementation stated in 1.2.9.4 is not observed.  As a result on 5 <sup>th</sup> March 2010 not all flight crew members performing international flights have level 4 of English or higher.	The reason of the difference: it is impossible to observe ICAO language proficiency requirements by the date of implementation.  To eliminate the difference a plan for implementation arrangements has been worked out.  The planned date of difference elimination is 5 <sup>th</sup> March 2011.

3. By the dates indicated below, Russian Federation will have complied with the language provisions as detailed in Table 1, paragraph 3 of Attachment B of this State letter for which differences have been notified in 2 above.

Annex Provision	Data	Comments
Annex 1. 1.2.9.4, Appendix 1, Attachment A	5 <sup>th</sup> March 2011	The regulatory framework is in place.  The date of commencement of ICAO language requirements implementation has been postponed to 5 <sup>th</sup> March 2011.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Data \_\_\_\_\_

**Table 1 – National Regulatory Framework**

Focal Point Information				
<b>Name</b>		Valery Pastukhov		
<b>Title</b>		Advisor in the Department of State Policy in Civil Aviation		
<b>Organization</b>		Ministry of Transport of Russian Federation		
<b>Telephone</b>		7 (495) 155 59 35		
<b>Fax</b>		7 (495) 155 68 73		
<b>E-mail</b>		Pastukhov_VV@SCAA.ru		
		Compliance		
Standards and Recommended Practices (SARPs)		<b>Yes</b> , the regulatory framework is in place.  <i>Indicate Reference</i>	The regulatory framework is <b>partially</b> in place.  <i>Briefly describe what is in place, remaining work and expected date of completion</i>	<b>No</b> , the national regulatory framework has not yet been established.  <i>Indicate the type of provision envisaged and the expected date of introduction</i>
Annex 1	1.2.9.1	Order №90 of 9 June 2007 of Russian Federation Transport Ministry.		
	1.2.9.4 Appendix 1 Attachment A	Order №90 of 9 June 2007 of Russian Federation Transport Ministry.		
	1.2.9.6	Order №90 of 9 June 2007 of Russian Federation Transport Ministry.		
	1.2.9.7 (Recommended Practice)	Order №90 of 9 June 2007 of Russian Federation Transport Ministry.		
	5.1.1.2 XIII)	Order №90 of 9 June 2007 of Russian Federation Transport Ministry.		
Annex 6	Part I – 3.1.8	Order №90 of 9 June 2007 of Russian Federation Transport Ministry		
	Part III – 1.1.3	Order №90 of 9 June 2007 of Russian Federation Transport Ministry		

**Table 2 – Estimate of National Level of Implementation**

<b>Date: December 23, 2009</b>			
<b>Pilots involved in international operations</b>	<b>ATPL and CPL</b>	<b>MPL</b>	<b>Method of Assessment of Level of Proficiency</b>
Level 3 and below	1 326	Can't be applied	The proficiency assessment of flight crew members performed by the qualified raters-assessors with the use of testing systems recommended by the Civil Aviation Authority of Russian Federation.
Level 4	2 752		
Level 5	80		
Level 6	29		

<b>PPL</b>			
<b>Date: December 23, 2009</b>			
Indicate number of PPLs involved in international operations	-	Briefly describe the method of Assessment of Level of Proficiency	Assessment has not been performed due to lack of candidates.

**Table 3 – Language Proficiency Training Programmes**

<b>State oversight of aviation language training has been established</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<i>Language Training will be provided through:</i>	
Air Operator/Airline	No
Educational Institutions, Aviation Training Centers, approved (certified) by Civil Aviation Authority.	Yes
Private organizations	No

**Table 4 – Language Proficiency Assessment (or Testing) for Licensing Purposes**

<b>State oversight of aviation language assessment has been established.</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Pilots</b>	
<b>The Language Proficiency Assessment is developed by:</b>	
Civil Aviation Authority	Yes
Air Operator	No
Educational Institution	No
Private Organization	No
<b>The Language Proficiency Assessment is administered by:</b>	
Civil Aviation Authority	Yes
Air Operator	No
Educational Institution, approved by Civil Aviation Authority (Civil Aviation Authority appoints experts for assessment of language testing).	Yes
Private Organization	No

**Table 5 – Interim Measures to Mitigate the Risk**

Pilots (international operations)	2010
<b>Commercial multi-pilot operations</b>	1. Flight crew formation taking into consideration English language proficiency level and international flight operation experience.
	2. Incorporating radiotelephony communication scenarios of non-routine and emergency situations into the flight simulator session program.
	3. Annual evaluation of radiotelephony communication skills in standard and emergency situations at proficiency evaluation of pilot's license.
	4. Compulsory language improvement training for obtaining next level for flight crews who have demonstrated language proficiency levels below level 4 according to the ICAO rating scale.
	5. Implementation of continuous language training with annual evaluation for maintaining level 4 and for further improvement of language proficiency skills.
	6. Enhancement of language training methodology for flight crews.
	7. Organizing workshops for experts in English language training for flight crews.
	8. ICAO training requirements compliance audits of the training centers certified for flight crew language training.
	9. As a consequence of activities listed above, the number of pilots who are supposed to have operational level of English language by the end of the year will amount at least 95%.
	10. In case of incompliance with the above mentioned interim measures to mitigate the risk the State Civil Aviation Authority makes a decision on international operator's license restrictions.
<b>General aviation multi-pilot operations</b>	ICAO requirements will be observed completely.
<b>Commercial single pilot operations</b>	ICAO requirements will be observed completely.
<b>General aviation single-pilot operations</b>	ICAO requirements will be observed completely.

**NOTIFICATION OF COMPLIANCE WITH OR DIFFERENCES  
FROM LANGUAGE PROVISIONS IN ANNEXES 1, 6, 10 AND 11**

(Reference to Table 1, paragraph 3, Attachment B)

To: The Secretary General  
International Civil Aviation Organization  
999 University Street  
Montreal, Quebec  
Canada H3C 5H7

1. No differences will exist on \_\_\_\_\_ between the national regulations and/or practices of **(State)** \_\_\_\_\_ and the language provisions as detailed in Table 1, paragraph 3 of Attachment B of this State letter.

2. The following differences will exist on 5 March 2010 between the regulations and/or practices of the Russian Federation and the language provisions as detailed in Table 1, paragraph 3 of Attachment B of this State letter. (Please see Note 3) below.)

a)	Annex Provision	b)	Difference Category	c)	Details of Difference	d)	Remarks
	Annex 1 Provision 1.2.9.4. Appendix 1, Attachment A		A		<p>ATS on international airways/routes and at international airports is provided in two languages, i.e. in Russian and in English.</p> <p>Existing practice: air traffic controllers holding a valid license and a certificate of completion of an approved aviation English training course are authorized for radiotelephony communications in English. A special authorization is endorsed on the air traffic controller license.</p> <p>The Russian Federation cannot provide a complete compliance with ICAO Language Proficiency Requirements from 5 March 2010. Extra time (until 5 March 2011) is needed.</p>		Lack of sufficient number of air traffic controllers demonstrating language proficiency at the Operational Level (Level 4).
	Annex 1 Provision 1.2.9.6.		-		-		-
	Annex 1 Provision 1.2.9.7.		B		The English language proficiency of air traffic controllers who demonstrate proficiency below the Expert		

	(Recommended practice)				<p>Level (Level 6) is formally evaluated at intervals in accordance with an individual's demonstrated proficiency level, as follows:</p> <p>a) those demonstrating language proficiency at the Operational Level (Level 4) are evaluated at least once every three years; and</p> <p>b) those demonstrating language proficiency at the Extended Level (Level 5) are evaluated at least once every six years.</p> <p>Besides a systematic evaluation of language proficiency, a formal refresher course of English is conducted once every three years. A State Certificate of Completion with an assessment mark is issued.</p>	Existing practice of English training in order to maintain a language proficiency of controllers involved in international operations.
	Annex 1 Provision 5.1.1.2. XIII)		B		A special authorization for international operations service in the English language is endorsed on the air traffic controller license.	Existing practice of endorsement on the license of air traffic controller involved in international operations. An endorsement of language proficiency will appear on the license before March 2011.
	Annex 10 Volume 2 Provision 5.2.1.2.1.		A		The air-ground radiotelephony communications in the airspace of the Russian Federation is conducted in the Russian language.	-
	Annex 10 Volume 2 Provision 5.2.1.2.2.		A		ATS on international airways/routes and at international airports is provided in two languages, i.e. in Russian and in English.	-
	Annex 10 Volume 2 Provision 5.2.1.2.3.		A		Standardized radiotelephony phraseology in two languages, i.e. in Russian and in English, is used as specified in the AIP of the Russian Federation.	-

	Annex 11 Provision 2.29.1.		A		The Language Proficiency Implementation Plan has been published on the ICAO web-site.		-
	Annex 11 Provision 2.29.2.		A		When ATC units of neighboring States conclude an agreement of cooperation, a mutual language is agreed between them as specified in "Order of Ministry of transport of Russia" of 16.07.2001 № HA-275-p.		-

3. By the dates indicated below,

The Russian Federation will have complied with the language provisions as detailed in Table 1, paragraph 3 of Attachment B of this State letter for which differences have been notified in 2 above.

a)	Annex Provision	b)	Date	c)	Comments
	1) Annex 1 Provision 1.2.9.4. Appendix 1, Attachment A 2) Annex 1 Provision 5.1.1.2. XIII)		Before 5 March 20011		

Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Table 1. National Regulatory Framework

Focal Point Information				
Name		Valery Pastukhov		
Title		Advisor in the Department of State Policy in Civil Aviation		
Organization		Ministry of Transport of Russian Federation		
Telephone		7 (495) 155 59 35		
Fax		7 (495) 155 68 73		
E-mail		Pastukhov_VV@SCAA.ru		
Compliance				
Standards and Recommended Practices (SARPS)		Yes, the regulatory framework is in place.	The regulatory framework is <b>partially</b> in place.	No, the national regulatory framework has not yet been established.
Annex 1	1.2.9.1	-	-	-
	1.2.9.2	1. Order of Federal Air Navigation Authority "Notification to the Aviation Personnel concerning ICAO Language Proficiency Requirements" of 19.06.2006 № 14-p. 2. Order of Ministry of transport of Russia of 26.11.2009 № 216 "FAR: Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers".	-	-
	1.2.9.4 Appendix 1 Attachment A	1. Order of Federal Air Navigation Authority "Notification to the Aviation Personnel concerning ICAO Language Proficiency Requirements" of 19.06.2006 № 14-p. 2. Order of Ministry of transport of Russia of 26.11.2009 № 216 "FAR: Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers".	-	-
	1.2.9.6	In accordance with the Order of Ministry of transport of Russia of 26.11.2009 № 216 "FAR: Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers" the language proficiency of air traffic controllers who demonstrate proficiency below the Expert Level (Level 6) is formally evaluated at intervals in accordance with an individual's demonstrated proficiency level.	-	-
	1.2.9.7 (Recommended practice)	In accordance with the Order of Ministry of transport of Russia of 26.11.2009 № 216 "FAR: Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers" the language proficiency of air traffic controllers who demonstrate proficiency below the Expert Level (Level 6) is formally evaluated at intervals in accordance with an individual's	-	-

		<p>demonstrated proficiency level, as follows:</p> <p>a) those demonstrating language proficiency at the Operational Level (Level 4) are evaluated at least once every three years; and</p> <p>b) those demonstrating language proficiency at the Extended Level (Level 5) are evaluated at least once every six years.</p> <p>Besides a systematic evaluation of language proficiency, a formal refresher course of English is conducted once every three years.</p>		
	5.1.1.2 XIII)	<p>In accordance with the “Manual of Professional Training of ATS Personnel of Civil Aviation” (Order of Federal Air Transport Authority of Russia of 01.02.2000 № 19-p) a special authorization for international operations service in the English language is endorsed on the air traffic controller license.</p>	<p>The “Manual of Professional Training of ATS Personnel of Civil Aviation” has been revised and renamed as the “Order of Continuous Professional Training of ATS Personnel”. The document is planned to come into force in 2010. According to its regulations, an endorsement of language proficiency will appear on the air traffic controller license.</p>	-
Annex 6	Part I – 3.1.8	-	-	-
	Part III – 1.1.3	-	-	-
Annex 10 Volume II	5.1.1.1	<p>ICAO standardized phraseology is used in all situations for which it has been specified.</p>	-	-
	5.2.1.2.1	<p>The air-ground radiotelephony communications in the airspace of the Russian Federation is conducted in the Russian language in accordance with Article 71 Provision 2 of Air Law Regulations of the Russian Federation and Order of Ministry of Transport of Russia №329.</p>	-	-
	5.2.1.2.2	<p>ATS on international airways/routes and at international airports is provided in two languages, i.e. in Russian and in English, in accordance with Article 71 Provision 2 of Air Law Regulations of the Russian Federation and Order of Ministry of Transport of Russia №329.</p>	-	-
	5.2.1.2.3	<p>The AIP of Russia specifies the use of standardized phraseology in two languages, i.e. in Russian and in English.</p>	-	-
Annex 11	2.29.1	<p>Language Proficiency Implementation Plan has been published on the ICAO web-site.</p>	-	-

	2.29.2	When ATC units of neighboring States conclude an agreement of cooperation, a mutual language is agreed between them as specified in "Instruction of Ministry of transport of Russia" of 16.07.2001 № HA-275-p.	-	-
--	--------	--	---	---

**Table 2. Estimate of National Level of Implementation**

<b>Date: 01-01-2010</b>				
Controllers involved in international operations	Aerodrome	Approach	Area	Method of Assessment of Level of Proficiency
Total /Formally evaluated	5370 persons /4346 persons			English Language proficiency tests selected and accredited by the Federal Air Navigation Authority: ELPET & RELTA
Level 2	881 persons			
Level 3	1895 persons			
Level 4 / Level 5	1570 persons			

**Table 3. Language Proficiency Training Programmes**

<b>State oversight of aviation language training has been established</b> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> , No <input type="checkbox"/> .	<b>If no, expected date of establishment:</b>
Language Training will be provided through: (Check all that apply)	
Air Navigation Service Provider	X
Air Operator/Airline	
Educational Institutions	X
Private Organizations	X

**Table 4. Language Proficiency Assessment (or Testing) for Licensing Purposes**

State oversight of aviation language training has been established.	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> , No <input type="checkbox"/> .	If no, expected date of establishment:
---	---	--

<b>Controllers</b>	
<b>The Language Proficiency Assessment was/is/will be developed by:</b>	
Civil Aviation Authority	X
Air Navigation Service Provider	
Educational Institution	
Private Organization	
<b>The Language Proficiency Assessment was/is/will be administered by:</b>	
Civil Aviation Authority	
Air Navigation Service Provider	X
Educational Institution	X
Private Organization	

**Table 5. Interim Measures to Mitigate the Risk**

<b>International Operations</b>	<b>2010</b>
Controllers	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Shift-team staffing with the reasonable number of controllers with Operational Level (Level 4).</li><li>2. Employment requirements for ATS applicants - Operational Level (Level 4).</li><li>3. Further development of national regulatory framework concerning English Language Proficiency and ATS operations.</li><li>4. Practice of continuous training in English to attain and to maintain a required level of ELP for controllers involved in international operations.</li></ol>